

# Public Document Pack

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance  
on Wednesday, 10th January, 2024 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor Phil Murphy (Chairman)  
County Councillor Dale Rooke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: Emma Bryn, Sara Burch, Jan Butler,  
John Crook, Tony Easson, Steven Garratt, Meirion Howells,  
Su McConnel, Jayne McKenna, Maureen Powell, Sue Riley and  
Ann Webb

County Councillor Malcolm Lane attended the meeting by invitation  
of the Chair.

### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Paige Moseley	Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer
Anna Hawker	Trainee Solicitor

County Councillor Tony Easson joined the meeting during discussion of application  
DM/2023/01329.

County Councillor Jayne McKenna left the meeting during discussion of application  
DM/2023/01030 and did not return.

### **APOLOGIES:**

County Councillors: Jill Bond, Fay Bromfield and Ian Chandler

#### **1. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor Sara Burch declared a personal, non-prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2023/01030, as she was the relevant Cabinet Member when the decision to release the site to Monmouthshire Housing Association (MHA) for affordable Housing was taken.

County Councillor Phil Murphy declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2023/01042. He informed the Committee that posters had been circulated which had been purported to have come from him in relation to a planning enforcement matter on the same land that is now the subject of application DM/2023/01042. Although this current application is separate and distinct from the enforcement case and the posters were not prepared by

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Wednesday, 10th January, 2024 at 2.00 pm

him, he left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon in respect of this application.

#### **2. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 5<sup>th</sup> December 2023 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

#### **3. Application DM/2023/01042 - Change of use from agriculture to land for the keeping of horses (retrospective) proposed erection of stable block for five horses, erection of ancillary storage building, construction of manege. Land north-west of Holly Lodge Road From A48 To Dewstow Road, Fives Lanes, Caerwent.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented for refusal for the reasons outlined in the report.

This application has been re-presented to Planning Committee following the Committee decision not to agree a motion to approve the application at the meeting on 3rd October 2023. Therefore, in accordance with the Planning Code of Practice (February 2023) the application had been deferred for reasons for refusal to be considered based on the discussion within the meeting.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=HYqrgl9FM6S1ZvpK&t=189>

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor John Crook and seconded by County Councillor Emma Bryn that application DM/2023/01042 be refused for the following reasons:

- The application constitutes overdevelopment as it is of a scale and use that is out of keeping with the open countryside setting resulting in an adverse impact on the character of the landscape failing to comply with LDP Policies LC1 and RE6.
- The development will lead to an unacceptable level of traffic which will be detrimental to current residents and users of the existing single-track lane with few passing places, contrary to LDP Policy MV1.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	11
Against refusal	-	1
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Wednesday, 10th January, 2024 at 2.00 pm

We resolved that application DM/2023/01042 be refused for the following reasons:

- The application constitutes overdevelopment as it is of a scale and use that is out of keeping with the open countryside setting resulting in an adverse impact on the character of the landscape failing to comply with LDP Policies LC1 and RE6.
- The development will lead to an unacceptable level of traffic which will be detrimental to current residents and users of the existing single-track lane with few passing places, contrary to LDP Policy MV1.

**4. Application DM/2023/01329 - Change of Use of Glebe Bungalow to C3 dwellinghouse from Annex and Holiday Let granted permission under DC/2007/00778 and DC/2017/01200. Glebe Bungalow, Llantilio School Road, Llantilio Pertholey, Abergavenny, NP7 6NU.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented for refusal for the reason outlined in the report.

[https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=iCHwFEs\\_uzArSq7P&t=1655](https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=iCHwFEs_uzArSq7P&t=1655)

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Ann Webb and seconded by County Councillor Maureen Powell that consideration of application DM/2023/01329 be deferred for it to be re-presented to a future meeting of Planning Committee for approval with appropriate conditions.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For deferral	-	12
Against deferral	-	1
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/01329 be deferred for it to be re-presented to a future meeting of Planning Committee for approval with appropriate conditions.

**5. Application DM/2023/00711 - Re-open existing gateway. Treetops, Talycoed Road, Llantilio Crossenny, Abergavenny.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

<https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=BIXPa2srm7SD4S4X&t=3386>

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Maureen Powell and seconded by County Councillor Su McConnel that application DM/2023/00711 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance  
on Wednesday, 10th January, 2024 at 2.00 pm**

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	14
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/00711 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

**6. Application DM/2023/01030 - Proposed residential development of 46 affordable dwellings, car parking, landscaping and associated works. Land to the north of Caldicot School, Situated off Woodstock Way, Caldicot.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

[https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=\\_nptMk7eL4INfDdx&t=4510](https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=_nptMk7eL4INfDdx&t=4510)

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Dale Rooke and seconded by County Councillor Su McConnel that application DM/2023/01030 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/01030 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

**7. Application DM/2023/01242 - The construction of a workshop and machinery storage and associated development. Llan Farm, Nant Road To The Grange, The Hendre, Monmouth, NP25 5NX.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

[https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=wiJ3trDZs\\_oCro43&t=6413](https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=wiJ3trDZs_oCro43&t=6413)

In noting the detail of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Su McConnel and seconded by County Councillor Maureen Powell that application DM/2023/01242 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Wednesday, 10th January, 2024 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/01242 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

#### **8. FOR INFORMATION - The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals / Costs Decisions Received:**

<https://www.youtube.com/live/Xt9tbCEMmCU?si=u2d6SrODZxaU1H-4&t=6913>

##### **8.1. Appeal Decision - 25 Beaulieu Barn, Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouthshire.**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at 25 Beaulieu Barn, Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouthshire on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2023.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

##### **8.2. Costs Decision - 25 Beaulieu Barn, Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouthshire.**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to the costs decision in respect of 25 Beaulieu Barn, Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouthshire.

We noted that the application for an award of costs had been refused.

##### **8.3. Appeal Decision - Land off Hardwick Cottage, Hardwick Hill, Chepstow, Monmouthshire.**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at land off Hardwick Cottage, Hardwick Hill, Chepstow, Monmouthshire on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2023.

We noted that the appeal had been allowed and planning permission granted subject to the conditions set out in the schedule of the Planning Inspectorate report.

##### **8.4. Appeal Decision - Land opposite Rose Cottage, Llanbadoc, Usk, Monmouthshire.**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at land opposite Rose Cottage, Llanbadoc, Usk, Monmouthshire on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2023.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance  
on Wednesday, 10th January, 2024 at 2.00 pm**

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

**8.5. Appeal Decision - Land at Silver Circle Distillery, Pleasant View Barn,  
Ninewells Road, Catbrook, Trellech, Monmouthshire.**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at land at Silver Circle Distillery, Pleasant View Barn, Ninewells Road, Catbrook, Trellech, Monmouthshire on 9<sup>th</sup> May 2023.

**Appeal A**

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

**Appeal B**

We noted that the appeal had been allowed in respect of ground (g) only, but otherwise dismissed. The Notice was varied by the deletion of the words 'three months' and their substitution with the words 'six months' from the date the Notice took effect. Subject to this variation, the Notice was upheld.

**8.6. Costs Decision - Land at Silver Circle Distillery, Pleasant View Barn,  
Ninewells Road, Catbrook, Trellech, Monmouthshire.**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to the costs decision in respect of land at Silver Circle Distillery, Pleasant View Barn, Ninewells Road, Catbrook, Trellech, Monmouthshire.

We noted that the application for an award of costs had been refused.

**The meeting ended at 4.07 pm.**